

(Original version: <http://www2.bc.edu/~langerr/th485.htm>)

**From Diatribe to Dialogue: Studies in the Jewish-Christian Encounter ANTS
HIST 640/BC TH485.01**

Spring 2000

Prof. Robin Jensen
Phone: 964-1100 ext. 234
Office: Worcester 206 (ANTS)
Office Hours: M2-3, W2-3
rjensen@ants.edu

Prof. Ruth Langer
Phone: 552-8492
Office: Carney 412 (BC)
Office Hours: M 2-3, W10-11
langerr@bc.edu

Course web page: <http://www2.bc.edu/~langerr/TH485.htm> (if you receive an error message, eliminate th485.htm from the address and link from the Langer home page)

Christians and Jews, living together, have never ignored one another. Only in our times have these encounters begun to include positive affirmations of the other. To provide the student with a background for the contemporary situation, this course will explore various theological facets of this encounter, from the diatribes of earliest Christianity through the medieval disputations, concluding with the contemporary dialogue. Readings will be drawn from Jewish and Christian primary sources in translation. This course is an exercise in interreligious learning, sponsored by the Boston College's Center for the Study of the Jewish and Christian Relationship.

Course Requirements:

- Attendance at class is expected. As a courtesy to your professors, please let us know if you have to be absent. Because there are so few class sessions, unnecessary absences will affect your grade.
- Participation in class discussions and on-line discussion group. Students will be asked to present some of the readings. (20%)
- 20 page research paper. (45%)
- Final exam. (35%)

If you have a disability that requires consideration by your professors, please contact one of us during the first week of class to make appropriate arrangements.

Texts (available at the ANTS Bookstore):

- EPJCC: Essential Papers on Judaism and Christianity in Conflict: From Late Antiquity to the Reformation, ed. Jeremy Cohen, (NYU Press, 1991).
- Edward Flannery, *The Anguish of the Jews* (Paulist Press, 1985).
- Hyam Maccoby, *Judaism on Trial: Jewish-Christian Disputations in the Middle Ages* (Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 1982, rpt. 1996).
- Jacob Katz, *Exclusiveness and Tolerance: Studies in Jewish-Gentile Relations in Medieval and Modern Times* (Behrman House, 1961).
- Jeremy Cohen, *Living Letters of the Law: Ideas of the Jew in Medieval Christianity* (University of California Press, 1999).

1. Background (January 31)

READ PRIOR TO THE FIRST CLASS: The Gospel of John and Paul's Epistle to the Galatians.

Additional bibliography:

- Peter Schaefer, *Judeophobia: Attitudes toward the Jews in the Ancient World* (Harvard U. Press, 1997). See the discussions of this book by Robert Goldenberg and Christine Hayes in *Jewish Studies Quarterly* 6 (1999).
- John Gager, *The Origins of Anti-Semitism: Attitudes Toward Judaism in Pagan and Christian Antiquity* (Oxford U. Press, 1985).
- James Parkes, *The Conflict of the Church and the Synagogue: A Study in the Origins of Antisemitism* (goes through the Byzantine period – World Pub., 1961).
- Marcel Simon, *Verus Israel* (Oxford U. Press, 1986), chaps. 1-7.

2. Separation (Feb 7)

Assignments:

- Justin Martyr (Dialogue with Trypho) http://ccel.wheaton.edu/fathers2/ANF-01/anf01-48.htm#P4043_787325
- Reserve: Melito of Sardis (On the Pasch), text and trans., Stuart Hall (Oxford, 1979).
- Early Jewish references to Jesus from: <http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/~hummm/Topics/JewishJesus> (save Toldot Yeshu for next week) OR: R. Travers Herford, *Christianity in Talmud and Midrash* (1903, rpt. Ktav, 1975), 35-96 – to be read with the understanding that Herford's historiography and conclusions are considered highly questionable today.
- EPJCC: Schiffman, "At the Crossroads: Tannaitic Perspectives on the Jewish-Christian Schism", 431-457.
- Flannery, *Anguish*, chapters 1-2, pp. 7-46.

Additional bibliography:

- Lawrence H. Schiffman, *Who Was a Jew? Rabbinic and Halakhic Perspectives on the Jewish-Christian Schism* (Ktav, 1985).

- Morris Goldstein, *Jesus in the Jewish Tradition* (Macmillan, 1950).
- Jacob Z. Lauterbach, "Jesus in the Talmud" in his *Rabbinic Essays*.
- Reuven Kimelman, "Birkat Ha-Minim and the Lack of Evidence for an Anti-Christian Jewish Prayer in Late Antiquity," in *Jewish and Christian Self-Definition*, vol. 2, ed. E.P. Sanders (Fortress, 1981), pp. 226-244.
- Reuven Kimelman, "Identifying Jews and Christians in Roman-Syrian Palestine,"
- Steven Wilson, *Related Strangers: Jews and Christians 70-170 C.E.* (Fortress, 1995).
- Judith M. Lieu, *Image and Reality: The Jews in the World of the Christians in the Second Century* (T&T Clark, 1996).
- *Contra Iudaeos: Ancient and Medieval Polemics between Christians and Jews*, ed. Limor and Stroumsa (Brill, 1996).

3. Theological arguments (February 14)

Assignments:

- Toledot Yeshu (The Life of Jesus):
<http://ccat.sas.upenn.edu/~hummm/Topics/JewishJesus/toledoth.html>
- Reserve: Herbert W. Basser, "The Acts of Jesus," in *The Frank Talmage Memorial Volume I*, ed. Barry Walfish (Haifa University Press, 1993), 273-282.
- John Chrysostom, *Sermons I.* (recommended II-VI):
<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/chrysostom-jews6.html>
- Reserve: Augustine, *Sermons 199 and 200 (for Epiphany)*, trans, and notes by Edmund Hill, *Works of St. Augustine*, part III, vol. 6 (1990).
- Flannery, *Anguish*, chaps 3-4, pp. 47-89.
- Cohen, *Living Letters*, chap. I: Augustinian Foundations.

Additional bibliography:

- Marc Hirshman, *A Rivalry of Genius: Jewish and Christian Biblical Interpretation in Late Antiquity* (SUNY, 1996).
- Simon, *Verus Israel*, chaps. 8-end.

4. Christian Mission (Feb 28)

Assignments:

- *Jewish Crusades Chronicles: Soloman bar Samson: The Crusaders in Mainz, May 27, 1096* <http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/1096jews-mainz.html>
- Reserve: Poetry responding to the Crusades: *Penguin Book of Hebrew Verse*, ed. and trans. T. Carmy, (1981), pp. 372-384, "The Martyrs of Mainz" (anonymous), "The Sacrifices" (David bar Meshullam of Speyer), "Be Not Far From Me" (Ephraim of Regensburg), "The Slaughter of Isaac and his Revival" (Ephraim of Bonn).
- Katz, *Exclusiveness and Tolerance*, chaps. I-VIII.
- EPJCC: Ivan Marcus, "From Politics to Martyrdom: Shifting Paradigms in the Hebrew Narratives of the 1096 Crusade Riots," 469-483.

- Cohen, *Living Letters*, chap. III: Reconceptualization of Jewish Belief in the 12th century.
- Flannery, *Anguish*, chap. 5, pp. 90-121.

Additional bibliography

- R.I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society* (Blackwell, 1987).
- Robert Chazan, - a long list of books and articles...

5. Popular Religion: Images of the “Other”

March 6:

- Images of Jews in Christian Art: no specific assignment, although sources are listed in the additional bibliography
- Discussion of Cohen, *Living Letters* Part III.

March 20:

Assignments:

- William of Norwich:
<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/1173williamnorwich.html>
- Ephraim of Bonn on the York Massacre:
<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/ephr-bonn1.html>
- Massacre at Blois: <http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/1171blois.html>
- Blood libel: <http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/rinn.html> - explore the links here.
- Reserve: Poetry: Penguin Book of Hebrew Verse, ed. and trans. T. Carmy, (1981), 384-388: “Lament for the Massacre at Blois” (Ephraim of Bonn), “The Martyrs of Blois” (Barukh of Magenza), “The Murder of Bellet and Hannah” (Eliezer bar Judah of Worms).
- EPJCC: Solomon Grayzel, “The Papal Bull Sicut Judeis,” pp. 231-259.
- Reserve: “Jews in Medieval Sermon Stories,” Ch. 4 of Joan Young Gregg, *Devils Women and Jews: Reflections of the Other in Medieval Sermon Stories* (SUNY, 1997), 169-233.
- Reserve: “Christians and Jews: Some Positive Images” and “Christians and Christianity in the Sermons of Jacob Anatoli,” in Marc Saperstein, *Your Voice is Like a Ram’s Horn: Texts and Themes in Traditional Jewish Preaching* (HUC, 1996), 45-74. Recommended: “A Sermon on the Aqedah from the Generation of the Expulsion”, 251-280.

Additional bibliography:

- R. Po-Chia Hsia, *Trent 1475: Stories of a Ritual Murder Trial* (Yale, 1992).
- Idem. *The Myth of Ritual Murder: Jews and Magic in Reformation Germany* (Yale, 1988).
- W. Seiferth, *Synagogue and Church in the Middle Ages: Two Symbols in Art and Literature* (Frederick Ungar, 1970).
- H. Schreckenberg, *The Jews in Christian Art* (Continuum, 1996).

- R. Mellinkoff, *Outcasts: Signs of Otherness in Northern European Art of the Late Middle Ages* (Univ. of California, 1993).
- _____, *The Horned Moses in Medieval Art and Thought* (Univ. of California, 1970).
- A. Dundes, *The Blood Libel Legend* (which has much the same material as the web sites listed above).
- S. Lipton, *Images of Intolerance: the Representation of Jews and Judaism in the Bible Moralisee* (Univ. of California, 1999).

6. Disputation tradition I: The Formal Disputations (March 27)

Assignments:

- Hyam Maccoby, *Judaism on Trial: Jewish-Christian Disputations in the Middle Ages* (Littman Library, 1982, rpt. 1996) – Barcelona, Paris, and Tortosa – Jewish and Christian accounts.
- Katz, *Exclusiveness and Tolerance*, chap. IX.

Additional bibliography:

- Jeremy Cohen, *The Friars and the Jews* (Cornell, 1982).
- Robert Chazan, *Church, State, and Jews in the Middle Ages* (Behrman House, 1980).
- Robert Chazan, *Daggers of Faith*
- A.S. Abulafia, *Christians and Jews in the Twelfth Century Renaissance* (Routledge, 1995).
- John Y.B. Hood, *Aquinas and the Jews* (U. of Pennsylvania, 1995).

7. Disputation tradition II: Missionary Traditions and Responses (April 3)

Assignments:

- Reserve: David Berger, *The Jewish-Christian Debate in the High Middle Ages: A Critical Edition of the Nizzahon Vetus* (Jewish Publication Society, 1979): 347-369. (Appendices with specific explanation of the dynamics of the main texts): 41-63 (Genesis), 136-165 (Psalms); 167-230 (Critique of Gospels and Christianity); recommended: Berger's introduction and notes...
- A Christian missionary manual in translation
- Reserve: Jeremy Cohen, *The Friars and the Jews* (Cornell, 1982), pp. 13-16, 199-264 (Recommended: the entire book).

Additional bibliography:

- Libby Garshowitz, "Shem Tov ben Isaac Ibn Shaprut's Gospel of Matthew" in *The Frank Talmage Memorial Volume I*, ed. Barry Walfish (Haifa University Press, 1993), 297-322.
- EPJCC: Cecil Roth, "The Medieval Conception of the Jew: A New Interpretation."

8. Disputation Tradition III: Theological Formulations (April 10)

Assignments:

- Thomas Aquinas, "On Disbelief," from the Summa Theologica (2.2 question 10): <http://www.newadvent.org/summa/301000.htm>
- Reserve: Daniel J. Lasker, *The Refutation of The Christian Principles by Hasdai Crescas* (SUNY, 1992): text itself: 23-84.
- Cohen *Living Letters*, Part IV.
- Flannery, *Anguish*, chaps. 6-7, pp. 122-159.

Recommended:

- Daniel J. Lasker, *Jewish Philosophical Polemics Against Christianity in the Middle Ages* (New York, 1977) – or his dissertation by the same title, Brandeis, 1975).
- * Joseph Albo, *Sefer Ha-'Ikkarim*, Book of Principles, trans. Isaac Husik (Jewish Publication Society, 1930 and reprinted).
- John Y.B. Hood, *Aquinas and the Jews* (U. of Pennsylvania, 1995).
- The Sephardi Legacy, ed. Haim Beinart (Jerusalem: Magnes, 1992), articles by Haim Beinart, "The Great Conversion and the Converso Problem," in, Vol. I: 346-382; "The Expulsion from Spain: Causes and Results", II: 11-41; "The Conversos in Spain and Portugal in the 16th to 18th Centuries," II: 42-67.
- Y. F. Baer, *A History of the Jews in Christian Spain*
- Henry C Lea (1829-1909): *The Inquisition in 17th-Century Peru: Cases of Portuguese Judaizers*: <http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/17c-lea-limainquis.html>.
- N. Roth, *Conversos, Inquisition, and the Expulsion of the Jews from Spain* (Univ. of Wisconsin, 1995).

9. German reformation (April 17)

Assignments:

- Luther, "On Jews and their Lies"
<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/luther-jews.html>.
- Reserve: Luther, "That Christ Was Born a Jew," from *Luther's Works*, ed. J. Pelikan, vol. 45.
- Luther's letter to Spalatin:
<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/1514luther.html>
- Katz, *Exclusiveness and Tolerance*, Chaps. XI-XV. (16-18th c.).
- EPJCC: Edwards, "Against the Jews," 345ff.; Baron, "John Calvin and the Jews," 380ff.; Stow, "The Burning of the Talmud in 1553, in Light of Sixteenth-Century Catholic Attitudes Toward the Talmud," 401ff.

Recommended:

- H. Oberman, *The Roots of Anti-Semitism in the Ages of the Renaissance and Reformation* (Fortress, 1984).
- M. Edwards, *Luther's Last Battles: Politics and Polemics 1531-46* (Cornell U. Press, 1983).

10. Enlightenment 18th -19th centuries -- Modernity and anti-Christianity (April 24)

Assignments:

- Leiser's Catechism: <http://www.jewish-history.com/catechism/index.html> (or selections from his Jews and the Mosaic Law – also there).
- Warder Cresson's Key of David (polemical work against Christianity by a convert to Judaism): <http://www.jewish-history.com/catechism/index.html>.
- Handout: Jonathan D. Sarna, "The American Jewish Response to Nineteenth-Century Christian Missionaries" *Journal of American History* 68:1 (1981): 35-51.
- Reserve: Lessing, "On the Education of the Human Race," from *Theological Writings*, ed. H. Chadwick (1956).
- Flannery, *Anguish*, chaps. 8-9, pp. 160-195.

Recommended:

- Richard Menkis, "A Missionary Sermon to the Jews in Mid-Nineteenth-Century Montreal: Text and Contexts," in *The Frank Talmage Memorial Volume I*, ed. Barry Walfish (Haifa University Press, 1993), 333-349.
- *Essential Papers on Jewish-Christian Relations in the United States: Imagery and Reality*, ed. Naomi W. Cohen (SUNY, 1990).
- George K. Anderson, *The Legend of the Wandering Jew* (Brown, 1991), 11-28, 174-289.

11. Early 20th century (May 1)

Assignments:

- Henry Ford, *The International Jew*
<http://www.islamzine.com/ideologies/zionism/Ford/>.
- *Protocols of the Elders of Zion*
ftp://ftp.std.com/obi/Rants/Protocols/The_Protocols_of_The_Learned_Elders_of_Zion.
- *Discussion of the Protocols*:
<http://www.igc.apc.org/ddickerson/protocols.html>
- *Ritual Murder in the 20th Century*: http://www.melvig.org/jrm/jrm_toc.html (Note that the home page for this is a white supremacist site!).
- Reserve: *Jewish Perspectives on Christianity*, ed. Fritz Rothschild, section on Martin Buber (recommended: rest of book).

12. End of 20th century (May 8)

Assignments:

- <http://www.jcrelations.com/articl1.htm> List of contemporary scholarly articles on Jewish-Christian relations. Choose at least four to read, at least two by Jews.

- Flannery, *Anguish*, chaps. 10 to end (196-295).

Recommended:

- Websites, publications, and documents listed and/or linked at the jcrelations site.

General Additional Bibliography

A Select, Annotated Bibliography on Jewish-Christian Relations, Mary C. Boys and Barbara Veale Smith. <http://www.icjs.org/bibliog.html#Anchor-I> Subsections: I. Historical and Biblical Studies; II. General Resources Regarding the Relationship Between Jews and Christians; A. Anti-Judaism and Anti-Semitism: Historical Resources; B. Ecclesial Statements and Commentaries; C. Theological Resources; D. Educational and Liturgical Materials.

Medieval Jewish History sourcebook:

<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/sbook1t.html>

Abulafia, A.S., *Christians and Jews in Dispute: Disputational Literature and the Rise of Anti-Judaism in the West (c. 1000-1150)*, (Ashgate, 1998).

_____, *Christians and Jews in the Twelfth-Century Renaissance* (Routledge, 1995).

Baron, Salo W., *A Social and Religious History of the Jews*, 9 vols. (Columbia Univ., 1952-).

Cohen, J., *From Witness to Witchcraft: Jews and Judaism in Medieval Christian Thought* (Harrassowitz ver., 1996).

Fine, S., ed., *Jews, Christians, and Polytheists in the Ancient Synagogue* (Routledge, 1999).

Harbury, W., *Jews and Christians in Contact and Controversy* (T&T Clark, 1998).

Langmuir, G., *History, Religion, and Antisemitism* (University of California Press, 1990).

Lieu, J., North, J. and Rajak, T., eds., *The Jews among Pagans and Christians* (Routledge, 1992).

Mann, V., T. Glick, and J. Dodds, eds., *Convivencia: Jews, Muslims, and Christians in Medieval Spain* (Geore Braziller, 1992).

Marcus, Jacob R., *The Jew in the Medieval World: A Sourcebook 315-1791* (Atheneum, 1969).

Neusner, J. and E. Frerichs, eds., *To See Ourselves as Others See Us: Christians, Jews and Others in Late Antiquity* (Scholars Press, 1985).

Neusner, J., *Judaism in the Age of Constantine* (Univ. of Chicago, 1987).

Peters, E., *Inquisition* (Univ. of California, 1989).

Poliakov, L., *History of Antisemitism*, 4 volumes, trans. R. Howard (Vanguard Press, 1965-85).

Wilson, S. and P. Richardson, *Anti-Judaism in Early Christianity*, vols. 1-2 (Wilfred Laurier, 1986)

Wilson, S., *Related Strangers: Jews and Christians 70-170 CE* (Fortress, 1995)

Additional Useful Links

Various Handouts

Suggested Jewish Resources on the Web

Suggested Christian Resources on the Web